#### ZEICHNER ELLMAN & KRAUSE LLP

1211 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10036 TEL: (212) 223-0400

DIRECT DIAL (212) 826-5350 Rneumann@zeklaw.com

WWW,ZEKLAW,COM

June 7, 2018

#### BY ECF

Magistrate Judge Steven L. Tiscione United States District Court Eastern District of New York 225 Cadman Plaza East Room N324 Brooklyn, New York 11201

> Michelle Carter v. JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. Case No. 17-539 (ARR) (ST)

Dear Judge Tiscione:

We are counsel to defendant JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. in the above-referenced action. Attached is a copy of the transcript of your Honor's June 7, 2018 ruling regarding the videotaping of plaintiff's deposition.

Respectfully submitted,

Ronald M. Neumann

RMN:mzg Attachment

cc: To all counsel by ECF

		Page 1
1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
	EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	
2	Case No. 17-cv-539(AMD)(SLT)	
3	x	
4	MICHELLE CARTER,	
5	Plaintiff,	
6	vs.	
7	JPMORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A.,	
8	Defendant.	
9	X	
10	JPMORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A.,	
11	Third-Party Plaintiff,	
12	vs.	
13	DAHALEEL 1, INC. d/b/a ROCKAWAY	
14	FARM DELI & GRILL, SALEM N.	
15	AL-GEMSH, SALAH M. OMAIRAT, AMMAR	
16	Y. AWAWDEH, et al.,	
17	Third-Party Defendants.	
18	x	
19	VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF	
20	MICHELLE CARTER	
21	New York, New York	
22	Thursday, June 7, 2018	
23	11:45 a.m.	
24		
	Reported by:	
25	Maureen Ratto, RPR, CCR	

Page 2	Page 4
1 ***	1 APPEARANCES:
2	2 Counsel for Third-Party Defendants
3 Videotaped deposition of MICHELLE	3 Dahaleel 1, Inc., Salem N. Al-Gemsh:
4 CARTER, held at the offices of Zeichner	4 LAW OFFICES OF RAY BECKERMAN, P.C.
5 Ellman & Krause, LLP, 1211 Avenue of	5 108-18 Queens Boulevard
6 the Americas, New York, New York 10036	6 Forest Hills, New York 11375
7 pursuant to notice, before Maureen	7 718-544-3434
8 Ratto, Certified Court Reporter,	8 BY: RAY BECKERMAN, ESQ.
9 License No. XI01165, Registered	9 ray@beckermanlegal.com
10 Professional Reporter, License No.	10
11 817125, and Notary Public.	11 Counsel for Third-Party Defendant
12	12 Mukhter Omairat and Pickles & Olives,
13 ***	13 Inc.:
14	14 THE VOLAKOS LAW FIRM, P.C.
15	15 120 Bay Ridge Avenue
16	16 Brooklyn, New York 11220
17	17 718-836-4800
18	18 BY: KONSTANTINOS VOLAKOS, ESQ.
19	19 volakosesq@volakoslaw.com
20	20
21	21
22	22
23	23
24	24
25	25
Page 3	Page
1 APPEARANCES:	1 APPEARANCES:
2 Counsel for the Plaintiff:	2 Counsel for Third-Party Defendant
3 KUPILLAS, UNGER & BENJAMIN, LLP	3 Salah Omairat:
4 5 Penn Plaza	4 LAW OFFICE OF MICHAEL T. SUCHER
5 New York, New York 10001	5 26 Court Street Suite 2412
6 212-655-9536	6 Brooklyn, New York 11242
7 BY: JEFFREY BENJAMIN, ESQ.	7 718-522-1995
8 jbenjamin@nyfraudlaw.com	8 BY: ANDREW SHABASSON, ESQ.
9	9 nylawyer@aol.com
10 Counsel for the Defendant- Third-Party	10
11 Plaintiff:	11 Counsel for Third-Party Defendant
12 ZEICHNER ELLMAN & KRAUSE, LLP	12 Ammar Y. Awawdeh:
13 1211 Avenue of the Americas	13 LAW OFFICE OF ALI NAJMI
14 New York, New York 10036	14 261 Madison Avenue
15 212-223-0400	15 New York, New York 10016
IN MEN PERSONAL LIBERT AND A MINISTER WALL	16 212-401-6222 17 BY: ALI NAJMI, ESQ.
The state of the s	TO BY ALLING INCLUDENCE
17 rneumann@zeklaw.com	
<ul><li>17 rneumann@zeklaw.com</li><li>18 DAVID HAMILTON, ESQ.</li></ul>	18 ali@najmilaw.com
<ul><li>17 rneumann@zeklaw.com</li><li>18 DAVID HAMILTON, ESQ.</li><li>19 dhamilton@zeklaw.com</li></ul>	18 ali@najmilaw.com 19 NATALIE MICELI
<ul> <li>17 rneumann@zeklaw.com</li> <li>18 DAVID HAMILTON, ESQ.</li> <li>19 dhamilton@zeklaw.com</li> <li>20</li> </ul>	18 ali@najmilaw.com 19 NATALIE MICELI 20
17 rneumann@zeklaw.com 18 DAVID HAMILTON, ESQ. 19 dhamilton@zeklaw.com 20	18 ali@najmilaw.com 19 NATALIE MICELI 20 21 ALSO PRESENT:
17 rneumann@zeklaw.com 18 DAVID HAMILTON, ESQ. 19 dhamilton@zeklaw.com 20 21	18 ali@najmilaw.com 19 NATALIE MICELI 20 21 ALSO PRESENT: 22 JOHN SONG, ESQ.
17 rneumann@zeklaw.com 18 DAVID HAMILTON, ESQ. 19 dhamilton@zeklaw.com 20 21 22 23	18 ali@najmilaw.com 19 NATALIE MICELI 20 21 ALSO PRESENT: 22 JOHN SONG, ESQ. 23 In-House Counsel JPMorgan Chase Bank.
17 rneumann@zeklaw.com 18 DAVID HAMILTON, ESQ. 19 dhamilton@zeklaw.com 20 21 22	18 ali@najmilaw.com 19 NATALIE MICELI 20 21 ALSO PRESENT: 22 JOHN SONG, ESQ.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	VIDEOGRAPHER: Good morning.  Here begins the video recorded deposition of Michelle Carter taken by the Defendant Third-Party Plaintiff in the matters of Michelle Carter plaintiffs versus	1 2 3 4	Office of Michael Sucher, for Salah Omairat, Third-Party Defendant. MR. NAJMI: Law Office of Ali Najmi, for Third-Party Defendant
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Here begins the video recorded deposition of Michelle Carter taken by the Defendant Third-Party Plaintiff in the matters of	2 3 4	Omairat, Third-Party Defendant. MR. NAJMI: Law Office of Ali
3 4 5 6 7 8 9	deposition of Michelle Carter taken by the Defendant Third-Party Plaintiff in the matters of	3 4	MR. NAJMI: Law Office of Ali
4 5 6 7 8 9	by the Defendant Third-Party Plaintiff in the matters of	4	
5 6 7 8 9	Plaintiff in the matters of	1	CANTON TO THE CONTRACTOR OF TH
6 7 8 9		5	Ammar Awawdeh.
7 8 9		6	MR. SONG: John Song, In-House
8 9	JPMorgan Chase Bank N A Defendant,	7	Counsel for JPMorgan Chase.
9	and JPMorgan Chase Bank N A	8	MR. HAMILTON: David Hamilton,
	Third-Party Plaintiff against	9	counsel for JPMorgan Chase.
10	Dahaleel 1, incorporated doing	10	VIDEOGRAPHER: Will the court
11	business as Rockaway Farm Deli and	11	reporter please swear in the
12	grill, et al Third-Party	12	witness.
13	Defendants, Civil Action No. 127 CV	13	* * *
14	00539 in the United States District	14	MICHELLE CARTER, having
15	Court, Eastern District of New		been first duly sworn according to law
16	York.	16	by the Officer, testifies as follows:
17	This deposition is proceeding		DIRECT EXAMINATION BY NEUMANN:
18	at Zeichner Ellman & Krause, LLP	18	Q. Ms. Carter, I have some
19	1211 Avenue of the Americas, New	19	preliminary questions I'd like to ask
20	York, New York 10036 on Thursday,	20	you. My name is Ronald Neumann.
21	June 7, 2018 at approximately	21	Have you ever had your
22	11:54.	22	deposition taken before in any matter?
23	My name is Howard Brodsky and	23	A. Yes.
24	I'm the Legal Video Specialist in	24	Q. And what matter was that?
25	association with David Feldman	25	A. With my lawyer.
ALL DELICATION OF THE PARTY OF	Page 7		Page 9
1	worldwide incorporated with offices	1	Q. Have you been a plaintiff or a
2	located in Mineola, New York. The		party in any other litigation, in which
3	court reporter is Maureen Ratto, in		your deposition was taken?
4	association with David Feldman	4	A. No.
5	worldwide incorporated will counsel	5	Q. Did you ever sue either the
6	please state their appearances for		City of New York or the Transit
7	the record.	i	Authority?
8	MR. NEUMANN: Ronald Neumann,	8	A. Yes.
9	Zeichner, Ellman & Krause, LLP for		Q. And you were a plaintiff in
10	Defendant and Third-Party		that action, you were the suing party in
11	Plaintiff, JPMorgan Chase.		that action?
12	MR. BENJAMIN: Jeffrey	12	A. Yes.
13	Benjamin for the Plaintiff,	13	Q. And did you make a statement
14	Kupillas, Unger & Benjamin.		under oath in that action?
15	MR. BECKERMAN: Ray Beckerman,	15	A. Yes.
16	Law Office of Ray Beckerman, P.C.	16	Q. Do you understand that in this
17	attorneys for Third-Party	17	deposition today you're here testifying under oath?
18 19	Defendants Dahaleel 1, Inc. and Salem Al-Gemsh.	19	A. Yes.
20	MR. VOLAKOS: Konstantinos	20	
21	Volakos, the Volakos Law Firm P.C.		Q. And that you have a legal obligation to answer my questions
1 س	for Third-Party, Mukhter Omairat		truthfully?
		£ 4-	uuuiuii y i
22			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
22 23 24	and Pickles & Olives.  MR. SHABASSON: Andrew	23 24	A. Yes. Q. Is there any reason why you

[	n	10	
1		ige 10	A. Yes, I do. I want to know why
2			it's happening.
3		3	Q. Okay. It's happening at our
4		_	request.
5		5	A. On, just like that. Well, I
6	MR. BENJAMIN: Objection to	i	don't like it. I don't like it. If you're
7		7	
8	you mean	8	videotape.
9	MR. NEUMANN: medication.	9	MR. BENJAMIN: Well, they've
10	A. No.	10	
11	Q. If you would like to take a	11	Q. It's a matter of preserving
	break, please tell me and if there are no	12	the testimony.
	pending questions to be answered, you	13	A. It's a matter of me liking it
	will able to take a break at your	14	or not and wanting to do it and I don't,
	request. Do you understand that?	15	with no videotape.
16	A. Yes, I do.	16	Q. Ms. Carter, have you ever been
17	Q. If you do not understand a		known by any other names?
18	question, will you agree to ask for it to	18	A. I'm not going on.
	be repeated or for clarification?	19	MR. BENJAMIN: Let me speak to
20	A. I sure will.	20	her first quickly. There is no
21	Q. And then if you answer a	21	pending question.
	question, is it fair to assume that	22	MR. NEUMANN: There is a
	you've heard and understood it?	23	pending question.
24	A. Yes.	24	THE WITNESS: I'll tell
25	Q. Sometimes when answering a	25	everybody, this will be done
		ge 11	Page 13
	question you may think of documents that	1	without a video camera or it won't
	may help to give you to give a more	2	be done by me.
	accurate or complete answer and if that	3	MR. BENJAMIN: Let me talk to
	is the case you may request those	4	her outside.
	documents and I will attempt to provide	5	VIDEOGRAPHER: Time is 11:59.
	them. Do you understand that?  A. Yes.	6	We are off the record.
7		7	(Discussion is held off the
8	Q. And if I ask you a question	8	record.)
	that could be answered with a "yes" or	9	VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is
11	"no" response, will you agree to do that?  A. Yes.	10	12:01. We are on the record.
12		11	MR. BENJAMIN: After counsel's
	•	12	indication that this was being
14	questioning, other attorneys in the room will have the opportunity to ask	13	videotaped Ms. Carter has withdrawn
	questions, including your own lawyer. You	14	that consent. She does not, as of
	understand that?	15	today, want to proceed with a
17	A. Yes.	16	videotape.
18	Q. And the deposition today is	17	Of course, we're here, ready
	being videotaped and you understand that?	18	to proceed with a normal
20	A. No.	19	transcript. I didn't anticipate
21	Q. You're being videotaped. There	20	this, but she's not willing to
	is a camera.	21 22	consent to have a videotape at this
23	A. I don't understand why.	22 23	time.
24	Q. But you understand that it's	24	MR. NEUMANN: We provided
	happening. Is that correct?	25	notice as required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure that this
		20	reales of Civil Frocuult that this

[	P			
1	Page deposition was going to be	14 1	Page appear at our office at 10 a.m. on	16
2	videotaped, and you acknowledged	2	Monday, May 16 for her deposition	
3	receiving that notice.	3		
4	MR. BENJAMIN: I acknowledged	4	which we plan to videotape." Exhibit D-3 is an e-mail chain	
5	receiving the notice by e-mail and	5		
6	I didn't have an issue and I	6	that includes my e-mail to	
7	discussed this with her weeks ago.	7	Mr. Benjamin dated Thursday, May	
8	MR. NEUMANN: It's not the	8	31, 2018 and I've highlighted the	
9	witness' choice as to whether a	9	fact that, "The deposition will be	
10	deposition gets videotaped or not	10	videotaped and will take place at	
11	and we're not waiving our right to	11	our office beginning at 10 a.m."	
12	videotape her testimony. If	12	and Mr. Benjamin's response was,	
13	anything, this underscores the		"Can we start at 11 a.m.?", to	
14	reason why we need to have this	13	which we all agreed.	
15	videotaped.	14	Now, my colleague, David	
16	-	15	Hamilton, will call the Magistrate	
17	MR. BENJAMIN: Well, I don't	16	Judge. We're going to go off the	
18	know if it underscores the reason,	17	record and let the Magistrate Judge	
19	but she just is not willing to	18	know that we have a reporter	
1	proceed with the videotape. I can	19	present if he wishes to be on the	
20	only tell you that. I've talked to	20	record.	
21	her and she's refusing to go	21	(Exhibit D-1, Notice of	
22	forward with the videotape.	22	Deposition of Michelle Carter,	
23	MR. NEUMANN: Can we go off	23	dated February 13th, 2017, was	
24	the record?	24	received and marked on this date	
25	VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is	25	for identification.)	
1	Page 1 12:02. We are off the record.		Page I	17
2	(Discussion is held off the	1	(Exhibit D-2, e-mail	
3	record.)	2 3	correspondence from Ronald Neumann,	
4	MR. NEUMANN: As the	1	Jeffrey Benjamin and copied all	
5	transcript will reflect, when I	5	counsel dated May 9, 2018 was	
6	asked the witness the first		received and marked on this date	
7		6	for identification.)	
8	question she objected to the	7	(Exhibit D-3, e-mail	
9	videotaping and refused to go	8	correspondence from Ronald Neumann	
10	forward if the deposition was going	10	to Jeffrey Benjamin dated May 9,	
11	to be videotaped, which it is. The	10	2018 was received and marked on	
12	Plaintiff, Ms. Carter is not in the	11	this date for identification.)	
	room now, but she's represented by	12	(Discussion is held off the	
13	counsel.	13	record.)	
14	At this time I am marking	14	(Call is made to Magistrate	
15	three documents as Exhibits,	15	Judge Tiscione.)	
16	Defendant's Exhibit 1 is a Notice	16	MR. NEUMANN: We are on the	
17	of Deposition, it's dated February	17	record, your Honor. This is Ronald	
18	13th, 2017 and on that notice it	18	Neumann from Zeichner Ellman &	
19	says, "Take further notice that the	19	Krause. We represent the Defendant,	
20	deposition shall be recorded by	20	JPMorgan Chase in the case Michelle	
21	stenographic means and videotaped."	21	Carter versus JPMorgan Chase.	
22	D-2 is an e-mail that I sent	22	We're in a deposition room	ĺ
23	to Mr. Benjamin and copied all	23	with Plaintiff's counsel present,	-
24	counsel, in which I said, "Please	24	Chase counsel present and attorneys	-
25	confirm that Plaintiff Carter will	25	for all the Third-Party Defendants	

	Page	18		D 20
1	who wish to be present, which is	1	fearful of it, being on just	Page 20
2	multiple parties and we started to	2	having that video. There was I	
3	go forward with the deposition and	3	think, we at a prior conference, we	
4	when I asked my first substantive	4	talked about a YouTube video that	
5	question the witness refused to be	5	she was on.	
6	videotaped. As long as the	6	THE COURT: Okay.	
7	deposition is being videotaped she	7	MR. BENJAMIN: And that is	
8	refuses to answer any questions.	8	sort of, I think, the basis for	
9	She's now exited the room.	9	some of her fear, but, you know,	
10	I marked as exhibits the	10	I'm not contesting to notice by	
11	Notice of Deposition, dated in	11	counsel, it's just that I cannot	
12	February of this year which	12	and I've talked to her now this	
13	specifically provides notice that	13	morning, probably three times	
14	the deposition will be videotaped	14	trying to get her to consent and I	
15	and I marked as exhibits e-mails,	15	cannot do it.	
16	two e-mails sent out in May to	16	THE COURT: Well, I mean, I	
17	Plaintiff's counsel and copied all	17	don't see any basis for her not to	
18	the Defendants' counsel, again,	18	comply with the video deposition,	
19	reiterating that the deposition	19	since it is noticed and I don't	
20	will be videotaped. We're in the	20	really have a choice other than to	
21	room with the videographer who	21	order her to go forward with the	
22	initiated the video proceedings	22	deposition.	
23	until the Plaintiff refused to	23	MR. BENJAMIN: Well, I mean,	
24	continue.	24	is this something that we would	
25	THE COURT: All right. What is	25	have to brief by motion? I hate to	
	Page	19		Page 21
1	going on with your client?	1	open this up like that, but can we	***************************************
2	MR. BENJAMIN: Your Honor,	2	proceed today without the video and	
1				
3	this is Plaintiff's counsel,	3	leave the issue of video later to	SALES CONTRACTOR OF THE SALES
4	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle	4	be brought back, I suppose?	AL PROPERTY OF A MARKON A MERILANDON
4 5	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter.	4 5	be brought back, I suppose? I mean, it doesn't I'm just	MATERIAL PROPERTY AND ADMINISTRATION ADMINISTRATION ADMINISTRATION AND ADMINISTRATION ADMINISTRATION AND ADM
4 5 6	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter.  There is no issue of notice.	4 5 6	be brought back, I suppose? I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but	
4 5 6 7	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter. There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those	4 5 6 7	be brought back, I suppose? I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court	
4 5 6 7 8	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter. There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did	4 5 6 7 8	be brought back, I suppose? I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she	
4 5 6 7 8 9	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter. There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we	4 5 6 7 8 9	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her	
4 5 6 7 8 9	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter. There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I	4 5 6 7 8 9	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter. There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go forward with the videotape.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client to do the video deposition, or I	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Jeffrey Benjamin for Michelle Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go forward with the videotape.  She is ready to go forward	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client to do the video deposition, or I can say cancel the deposition,	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go forward with the videotape.  She is ready to go forward with a standard deposition with a	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client to do the video deposition, or I can say cancel the deposition, Plaintiff is going to be charged	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go forward with the videotape.  She is ready to go forward with a standard transcript but she is	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	be brought back, I suppose?  I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client to do the video deposition, or I can say cancel the deposition, Plaintiff is going to be charged for any costs that the Defendants	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go forward with the videotape.  She is ready to go forward with a standard deposition with a standard transcript but she is is simply refusing to proceed under	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client to do the video deposition, or I can say cancel the deposition, Plaintiff is going to be charged for any costs that the Defendants incurred for today and if you want	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go forward with the videotape.  She is ready to go forward with a standard deposition with a standard transcript but she is is simply refusing to proceed under video despite my advice and despite	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client to do the video deposition, or I can say cancel the deposition, Plaintiff is going to be charged for any costs that the Defendants incurred for today and if you want to litigate the issue of whether or	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go forward with the videotape.  She is ready to go forward with a standard deposition with a standard transcript but she is is simply refusing to proceed under video despite my advice and despite the notices we gave her.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client to do the video deposition, or I can say cancel the deposition, Plaintiff is going to be charged for any costs that the Defendants incurred for today and if you want to litigate the issue of whether or not it should be a video	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go forward with the videotape.  She is ready to go forward with a standard deposition with a standard transcript but she is is simply refusing to proceed under video despite my advice and despite the notices we gave her.  THE COURT: Okay. The reason	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client to do the video deposition, or I can say cancel the deposition, Plaintiff is going to be charged for any costs that the Defendants incurred for today and if you want to litigate the issue of whether or not it should be a video deposition, we can reconvene in the	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Carter.  There is no issue of notice. Counsel absolutely sent me those notices he mentioned, and I did notify Ms. Carter weeks ago when we first tried to go to deposition. I think it was two weeks ago.  Up until today we didn't think it was going to be a problem, but with the camera bearing down on her today, she is simply refusing to go forward with the videotape.  She is ready to go forward with a standard deposition with a standard transcript but she is is simply refusing to proceed under video despite my advice and despite the notices we gave her.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	I mean, it doesn't I'm just sort of ruminating about this, but I hate to I'm hoping the Court doesn't order something that she really is very much against her will physically, you know.  THE COURT: If you want to brief it I'm not going to do deposition without video if it was properly ordered as a video deposition. I can order your client to do the video deposition, or I can say cancel the deposition, Plaintiff is going to be charged for any costs that the Defendants incurred for today and if you want to litigate the issue of whether or not it should be a video	

1	Page 2	2	D 0
1	but I mean, if she had an objection	1	Page 24 the Judge's opinion on the
2	to it she should have raised it	2	9
3	before the deposition.	3	
4	MR. BENJAMIN: Okay. Well, let	4	2
5	me give her those two options and	5	0 - 0
6	but in any event, if we chose	6	Transfer of the state of the st
7	option two, and we were to come	7	
8	back, we would be subject to	8	3 C C , 1 , 1 , 1 , 1
9	videotaping by your order anyway.	9	
10	Isn't that correct? We would have	10	
11	to submit	11	.,
12	THE COURT: I don't know if	12	
13	there is a legitimate basis for	13	
14	objecting to a video deposition.	14	
15	I'll give you the opportunity to	15	
16	raise it. I'm not aware of any off	16	•
17	the top of my head, but there could	17	the reporter, the cost of the video
18	be something.	18	
19	I'll give you the opportunity	19	J
20	if you want to legally challenge	20	11 1
21	it, but, you know, as a general	21	
22	matter, video depositions are	22	heard him say that, but whatever
23	perfectly fine. So unless there is	23	he's ordering, I mean, if he's
24	some specific reason that you think	24	ordering that, then we're going to
25	there is a legal basis for her	25	pay, but I'm not sure he ordered
23			that in that phone call, exactly,
1	Page 2: objecting to the video deposition,	1	Page 25 but I guess you'll send me a bill.
2	I would probably urge you to do	2	MR. NEUMANN: We're adjourned.
3	your best to convince her to just	3	The time is 12:58 p.m.
4	do it.	4	VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is
5	MR. BENJAMIN: I'm going to go	5	12:58. We are on the record.
6	back to her now with those two	6	This concludes the video
7	options and see. I hope we don't	1	ins concludes are video
,		1 7	
	•	7	recorded testimony of Michelle
8	need any more of Your Honor's	8	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant,
8 9	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste	8 9	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday,
8 9 10	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll	8 9 10	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We
8 9 10 11	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.	8 9 10 11	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.
8 9 10 11 12	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess	8 9 10 11 12	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.  (The proceedings were
8 9 10 11 12 13	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need	8 9 10 11 12 13	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.
8 9 10 11 12 13 14	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers	8 9 10 11 12 13 14	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.  (The proceedings were
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.  (The proceedings were
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.  MR. NEUMANN: Thank very much	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.  (The proceedings were adjourned at 12:58 p.m.)
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.  MR. NEUMANN: Thank very much your Honor.	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.  (The proceedings were
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.  MR. NEUMANN: Thank very much your Honor.  THE COURT: All right.	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.  (The proceedings were adjourned at 12:58 p.m.)  MICHELLE CARTER
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.  MR. NEUMANN: Thank very much your Honor.  THE COURT: All right. Good-bye.	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record. (The proceedings were adjourned at 12:58 p.m.)  MICHELLE CARTER  Subscribed and sworn to before me
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.  MR. NEUMANN: Thank very much your Honor.  THE COURT: All right.  Good-bye.  (Discussion is held off the	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.  (The proceedings were adjourned at 12:58 p.m.)  MICHELLE CARTER
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.  MR. NEUMANN: Thank very much your Honor.  THE COURT: All right. Good-bye.  (Discussion is held off the record.)	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record. (The proceedings were adjourned at 12:58 p.m.)  MICHELLE CARTER  Subscribed and sworn to before me
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.  MR. NEUMANN: Thank very much your Honor.  THE COURT: All right. Good-bye.  (Discussion is held off the record.)  MR. BENJAMIN: After	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.  (The proceedings were adjourned at 12:58 p.m.)  MICHELLE CARTER  Subscribed and sworn to before me this day of, 20
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.  MR. NEUMANN: Thank very much your Honor.  THE COURT: All right. Good-bye.  (Discussion is held off the record.)  MR. BENJAMIN: After conferring with the Judge by	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record. (The proceedings were adjourned at 12:58 p.m.)  MICHELLE CARTER  Subscribed and sworn to before me
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	need any more of Your Honor's intervention with this and waste your time but I will try to, I'll bring her back these options.  THE COURT: All right. I guess see what you can do and if you need my intervention just call chambers again.  MR. NEUMANN: Thank very much your Honor.  THE COURT: All right. Good-bye.  (Discussion is held off the record.)  MR. BENJAMIN: After	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	recorded testimony of Michelle Carter, taken by the Defendant, Third-Party Plaintiff on Thursday, June 7, 2018. The time is 12:58. We are going off the record.  (The proceedings were adjourned at 12:58 p.m.)  MICHELLE CARTER  Subscribed and sworn to before me this day of, 20

	Page 26	1		***************************************				
1		1		ī	ERRATA SH	FET		Page 28
2	<del>_</del>	-			RITEXT LEC		LUTIONS	
1	Registered Professional Reporter, do	2			OLD COU			
					IINEOLA, N			
	hereby certify that prior to the	3			300.727.6396			
	commencement of the examination,	4					N CHASE BANK	
	MICHELLE CARTER was sworn by me to	5			ON DATE: J			
	testify the truth, the whole truth and				T: MICHEL E(S) CHAN		REASON	
8	nothing but the truth.	7				IGE	I I I	
9	I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that the	8						
10	foregoing is a true and accurate	9						
11	transcript of the proceedings as taken	10						
	stenographically by and before me at	11	-					
	the time, place and on the date	13		<u>                                     </u>	! 			
	hereinbefore set forth.	14		! [				
15	I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that I am	15						
	neither a relative nor employee nor	16						
	attorney nor counsel of any of the	17		<u> </u>	1			<del></del>
		18 19			l			
	parties to this action, and that I am	20						
	neither a relative nor employee of such	21						
	attorney or counsel, and that I am not			<u> </u>	MICHELLE (	CARTE	R	
	financially interested in this action.	22						
22							O BEFORE ME	
23	Marion Port		THIS	·	DAY OF _		, 20	
24	Maureen katto Maureen M. KATTO, RPR	24						
25	License No. 817125	25	NO	ARY	PUBLIC)	MY C	OMMISSION EXI	PIRES.
	D. 27							TICES.
1	Page 27 INDEX							
2	WWW.							
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·							
3	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY NEUMANN	\$						
4								
5	EXHIBITS							
6	Exhibit D-1, Notice of 16							
7	Deposition of Michelle Carter,							į
8	dated February 13th, 2017,							VIII ALA
9	Exhibit D-2, e-mail 17							
10	correspondence from Ronald							
11	Neumann, Jeffrey Benjamin and							
12	copied all counsel dated May 9,							
13	2018							
14	Exhibit D-3, e-mail 17							
15	correspondence from Ronald							
16	Neumann to Jeffrey Benjamin							
17	dated May 9, 2018							
18	uaicu 191ay 9, 2010							
19								
20								
21								
22								
23								
24								
25								İ
	t e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e							- 1

[& - brought] Page 1

	on a		
&	<b>2018</b> 1:22 6:21	action 6:13 9:10	aware 22:16
<b>&amp;</b> 1:14 2:5 3:3,12	16:7 17:4,10	9:11,14 26:18,21	awawdeh 1:16
4:12 6:18 7:9,14	25:10 27:13,17	adjourned 25:2,13	5:12 8:5
7:23 17:18	28:4	advice 19:21	b
0	212-223-0400 3:15	ago 14:7 19:9,11	<b>b</b> 1:13 7:25 24:7
<b>00539</b> 6:14	212-401-6222 5:16	agree 10:18 11:10	27:5
	<b>212-655-9536</b> 3:6	agreed 16:13	back 21:4 22:8
1	2412 5:5	al 1:15,16 4:3 6:12	23:6,11,25
<b>1</b> 1:13 4:3 6:10	<b>26</b> 5:5	7:19	bank 1:7,10 5:23
7:18 15:16 16:21	<b>261</b> 5:14	ali 5:13,17,18 8:3	6:7,8 28:4
27:6	3	amd 1:2	basis 20:8,17
<b>10</b> 16:1,10	3 16:4 17:7 27:14	americas 2:6 3:13	22:13,25
10001 3:5	<b>31</b> 16:7	6:19	bay 4:15
<b>10016</b> 5:15	<b>330</b> 28:2	ammar 1:15 5:12	bearing 19:14
<b>10036</b> 2:6 3:14	5	8:5	beckerman 4:4,8
6:20	5 3:4	andrew 5:8 7:24	7:15,15,16
<b>108-18</b> 4:5	<b>539</b> 1:2	answer 9:21 10:21	beckermanlegal
<b>11</b> 16:12		11:3 18:8	4:9
<b>11220</b> 4:16	7	answered 10:13	beginning 16:10
<b>11242</b> 5:6	7 1:22 6:21 25:10	11:9	begins 6:2
<b>11375</b> 4:6	28:4	answering 10:3,25	benjamin 3:3,7
<b>11501</b> 28:2	<b>718-522-1995</b> 5:7	anticipate 13:19	7:12,13,14 10:6
<b>11:45</b> 1:23	718-544-3434 4:7	anyway 22:9	12:9,19 13:3,11
<b>11:54</b> 6:22	<b>718-836-4800</b> 4:17	aol.com 5:9	14:4,16 15:23
<b>11:59</b> 13:5	8	appear 16:1	16:6 17:3,9 19:2,4
<b>120</b> 4:15	8 27:2,3	appearances 7:6	19:25 20:7,23
<b>1211</b> 2:5 3:13 6:19	<b>800.727.6396</b> 28:3	appropriate 24:19	22:4 23:5,22
<b>127</b> 6:13	<b>817125</b> 2:11 26:25	approximately	24:20 27:11,16
<b>12:01</b> 13:10		6:21	benjamin's 16:11
<b>12:02</b> 15:1	9	asked 15:6 18:4	best 23:3
<b>12:58</b> 25:3,5,10,13	9 17:4,9 27:12,17	association 6:25	<b>bill</b> 25:1
<b>13th</b> 15:18 16:23	a	7:4	boulevard 4:5
27:8	<b>a.m.</b> 1:23 16:1,10	assume 10:7,22	break 10:12,14
<b>16</b> 16:2 27:6	16:12	attempt 11:5	brief 20:25 21:12
<b>17</b> 1:2 27:9,14	able 10:14	attorney 26:17,20	24:8
2	absolutely 19:7	attorneys 7:17	bring 23:11
<b>2</b> 15:22 17:1 27:9	accurate 11:3	11:13 17:24	brodsky 6:23
<b>20</b> 25:20 28:23	26:10	authority 9:7	<b>brooklyn</b> 4:16 5:6
<b>2017</b> 15:18 16:23	acknowledged	avenue 2:5 3:13	brought 21:4
27:8	14:2,4	4:15 5:14 6:19	23:25
_,,,	, ,		
	Veritext Leg	al Calutiana	

## [business - farm]

Page 2

L			
business 6:11	commission 28:25	d	<b>district</b> 1:1,1 6:14
<b>bye</b> 23:19	complete 11:3	d 1:13 15:22 16:4	6:15
C	comply 20:18	16:21 17:1,7 27:1	documents 11:1,5
<b>c</b> 3:1 4:1 5:1 8:14	concludes 25:6	27:6,9,14	15:15
8:14 26:1,1	conclusion 11:12	dahaleel 1:13 4:3	doing 6:10
call 16:15 17:14	conference 20:3	6:10 7:18	<b>duly</b> 8:15
23:14,24 24:25	23:24	date 16:24 17:5,11	e
camera 11:22 13:1	conferring 23:23	26:13 28:4	e 3:1,1 4:1,1 5:1,1
19:14	confirm 15:25	dated 15:17 16:6	8:14,14,14 14:5
cancel 21:17	consent 13:14,21	16:23 17:4,9	15:22 16:4,5 17:1
carter 1:4,20 2:4	20:14	18:11 27:8,12,17	17:7 18:15,16
6:3,6 8:18 12:16	contesting 20:10	david 3:18 6:25	26:1,1 27:1,5,9,14
13:13 15:11,25	continue 18:24	7:4 8:8 16:14	eastern 1:1 6:15
16:22 17:21 19:5	convince 23:3	day 25:20 28:23	either 9:5
19:9 25:8,17 26:6	copied 15:23 17:3	defendant 1:8	ellman 2:5 3:12
27:2,7 28:4,5,21	18:17 27:12	3:10 4:11 5:2,11	6:18 7:9 17:18
case 1:2 11:4	<b>correct</b> 11:25	6:4,7 7:10 8:2,4	<b>employee</b> 26:16,19
17:20 28:4	22:10	17:19 25:8	errata 28:1
ccr 1:25	correspondence	defendant's 15:16	esq 3:7,16,18 4:8
certified 2:8	17:2,8 27:10,15	defendants 1:17	4:18 5:8,17,22
certify 26:4,9,15	cost 24:16,17	4:2 6:13 7:18	et 1:16 6:12
chain 16:4	costs 21:19 24:16	17:25 18:18 21:19	event 22:6
challenge 22:20	24:18	<b>deli</b> 1:14 6:11	everybody 12:25
chambers 23:14	counsel 3:2,10 4:2	deponent 28:5	exactly 24:25
change 28:6	4:11 5:2,11,23 7:5	deposition 1:19	examination 8:17
charged 21:18	8:7,9 15:13,24	2:3 6:3,17 8:22	26:5 27:3
<b>chase</b> 1:7,10 5:23	17:4,23,24 18:17	9:3,17 11:18 14:1	exercise 24:6
6:7,8 7:11 8:7,9	18:18 19:3,7	14:10 15:9,17,20	<b>exhibit</b> 15:16 16:4
17:20,21,24 28:4	20:11 26:17,20	16:2,8,22 17:22	16:21 17:1,7 27:6
<b>choice</b> 14:9 20:20	27:12	18:3,7,11,14,19	27:9,14
chose 22:6	counsel's 13:11	19:10,18 20:18,22	exhibits 15:15
<b>city</b> 9:6	country 28:2	21:13,15,16,17,23	18:10,15
<b>civil</b> 6:13 13:25	course 13:17	22:3,14 23:1 27:7	exited 18:9
clarification 10:19	court 1:1 2:8 5:5	28:4	expires 28:25
client 19:1 21:15	6:15 7:3 8:10	depositions 22:22	f
24:15	18:25 19:23 20:6	despite 19:21,21	f 26:1
colleague 16:14	20:16 21:7,11	dhamilton 3:19	
come 22:7	22:12 23:12,18 cv 1:2 6:13	direct 8:17 27:3	fact 16:8 fair 10:22
commencement	CV 1.2 0.15	discussed 14:7	farm 1:14 6:11
26:5		discussion 13:7	14 0:11
		15:2 17:12 23:20	
	Veritext Lea	1 ~ 1	

[fear - mineola]

Page 3

C 000			
fear 20:9	grill 1:14 6:12	issue 14:6 19:6	liking 12:13
fearful 20:1	guess 23:12 25:1	21:3,21 24:8	line 28:6
february 15:17	h	j	litigate 21:21
16:23 18:12 27:8	h 7:25 8:14 27:5	jbenjamin 3:8	litigation 9:2
federal 13:24	hamilton 3:18 8:8	jeffrey 3:7 7:12	llp 2:5 3:3,12 6:18
feldman 6:25 7:4	8:8 16:15	17:3,9 19:4 27:11	7:9
file 21:25	happening 11:25	27:16	located 7:2
financially 26:21	12:2,3	john 5:22 8:6	long 18:6
fine 22:23	hate 20:25 21:7	jpmorgan 1:7,10	m
firm 4:14 7:21	head 22:17	5:23 6:7,8 7:11	m 1:15 3:16 8:14
first 8:15 12:20	heard 10:23 24:21	8:7,9 17:20,21	26:2,24
15:6 18:4 19:10	held 2:4 13:7 15:2	28:4	madison 5:14
follows 8:16	17:12 23:20	judge 16:16,17	magistrate 16:15
foregoing 26:10	help 11:2	17:15 23:23 24:7	16:17 17:14
forest 4:6	hereinbefore	24:16	mail 14:5 15:22
form 10:7	26:14	judge's 23:25 24:1	16:4,5 17:1,7 27:9
forth 26:14	highlighted 16:7	june 1:22 6:21	27:14
forward 14:22	hills 4:6	25:10 28:4	mails 18:15,16
15:9 18:3 19:16	honor 17:17 19:2	k	marked 16:24
19:17 20:21 24:2	23:17		17:5,10 18:10,15
24:4	honor's 23:8	know 12:1 14:17	marking 15:14
<b>further</b> 15:19 26:9	hope 23:7	16:18 20:9 21:10	matter 8:22,24
26:15	hoping 21:7	22:12,21	12:11,13 22:22
future 21:24	house 5:23 8:6	known 12:17	matters 6:5
g	howard 6:23	konstantinos 4:18	maureen 1:25 2:7
gemsh 1:15 4:3	i	7:20	7:3 26:2,24
7:19		krause 2:5 3:12	mean 10:7,8 20:16
general 22:21	identification	6:18 7:9 17:19	20:23 21:5 22:1
give 11:2,2 21:24	16:25 17:6,11	<b>kupillas</b> 3:3 7:14	24:22
22:5,15,19	includes 16:5	1	means 15:21
go 14:21,23 15:8	including 11:15	l 8:14,14	medication 10:9
16:16 18:3 19:10	incorporated 6:10	law 4:4,14 5:4,13	mentioned 19:8
19:15,17 20:21	7:1,5	7:16,21,25 8:3,15	miceli 5:19
	incurred 21:20	lawyer 8:25 11:15	
23:5 24:2,4,14 going 12:18 14:1	indication 13:12	leave 21:3	michael 5:48:1
15:9 16:16 19:1	initiated 18:22	legal 6:24 9:20	michelle 1:4,20
19:13 21:12,18	interested 26:21	22:25 28:1	2:3 6:3,6 16:22
•	interfere 10:3	legally 22:20	17:20 19:4 25:7
23:5 24:5,23 25:11	intervention 23:9	legitimate 22:13	25:17 26:6 27:2,7
	23:14	license 2:9,10	28:5,21
<b>good</b> 6:1 23:19		26:25	mineola 7:2 28:2
**************************************		20.23	

## [monday - reconvene]

Page 4

notices 19:8,22	<u>.</u>	14:19 19:20 21:2	A COURT VILL MI.MU
noticed 20:19	p 3:1,1 4:1,1 5:1,1	proceed 13:15,18	reconvene 21:23
19:6 20:10 27:6	p	procedure 13:25	receiving 14:3,5
16:21 18:11,13	outside 13:4	23:2 problem 19:13	17:5,10
14:3,5 15:16,18,19	<b>ordering</b> 24:22,23	<b>probably</b> 20:13 23:2	received 16:24
notice 2:7 13:24	24:16,24	prior 20:3 26:4	14:14,17 19:23 22:24 28:6
28:25	ordered 21:14	preserving 12:11	reason 9:24 12:7
notary 2:11 25:23	21:15 22:9	17:23,24 18:1	really 20:20 21:9
normal 13:18	order 20:21 21:8	present 5:21 16:19	ready 13:17 19:17
6:15,19,20 7:2 9:6	23:11	preliminary 8:19	ray 4:4,8,9 7:15,16
4:6,16 5:6,15,15	options 22:5 23:7	10:12 15:24	26:2,24
2:6 3:5,5,14,14	option 22:7 24:6,7	please 7:6 8:11	ratto 1:25 2:8 7:3
new 1:1,21,21 2:6	21:25 22:15,19	plaza 3:4	raised 22:2
27:11,16	opportunity 11:14	<b>plan</b> 16:3	raise 22:16
24:12 25:2 27:3	opinion 24:1	plaintiffs 6:6	8:14 26:1
17:16,18 23:16	open 21:1	18:17 19:3 24:2	r 3:1 4:1 5:1 8:14
14:23 15:4 17:2,8	5:3 7:22 8:2	plaintiff's 17:23	A. Maritin
12:22 13:23 14:8	omairat 1:15 4:12	25:9	r
7:8 8:17,20 10:9	olives 4:12 7:23	18:23 21:18 24:3	quickly 12:20
neumann 3:16 7:8	<b>old</b> 28:2	9:1,9 15:11,25	11:15 18:8
neither 26:16,19	20:6 22:4	3:11 6:5,9 7:11,13	9:21 10:4,13
need 14:14 23:8,13	okay 12:3 19:23	plaintiff 1:5,11 3:2	questions 8:19
natalie 5:19	offices 2:4 4:4 7:1	place 16:9 26:13	questioning 11:13
names 12:17	officer 8:16	pickles 4:12 7:23	15:7 18:5
name 6:23 8:20	8:1,3 16:1,10	physically 21:10	11:1,8 12:21,23
5:18	office 5:4,13 7:16	phone 24:25	question 10:18,22
najmilaw.com	obligation 9:21	perfectly 22:23	queens 4:5
8:4	22:1	penn 3:4	q
najmi 5:13,17 8:3	objection 10:6	12:21,23	pursuant 2:7
<b>n.a.</b> 1:7,10	23:1	pending 10:13	28:25
27:1	objecting 22:14	pay 24:24	<b>public</b> 2:11 25:23
5:1 6:7,8 7:25	objected 15:7	25:9	provides 18:13
n 1:14 3:1 4:1,3	oath 9:14,18	8:2,4 9:2,10 17:25	provided 13:23
n	o 7:25	6:9,12 7:10,17,22	provide 11:5
multiple 18:2	0	4:2,11 5:2,11 6:4	properly 21:14
mukhter 4:12 7:22	nylawyer 5:9	party 1:11,17 3:10	26:3
21:25 24:8	3:8	parties 18:2 26:18	professional 2:10
motion 20:25	nyfraudlaw.com	page 28:6	25:12 26:11
morning 6:1 20:13	ny 28:2	p.m. 25:3,13	proceeding 6:17 proceedings 18:22
monday 16:2	notify 19:9	<b>p.c.</b> 4:4,14 7:16,21	i bi occcurie (i.i.)

[record - urge] Page 5

record 7:7 13:6,8	room 11:13 15:12	stenographically	third 1:11,17 3:10
13:10 14:24 15:1	17:22 18:9,21	26:12	4:2,11 5:2,11 6:4
15:3 16:17,20	rpr 1:25 26:24	street 5:5	6:9,12 7:10,17,22
17:13,17 23:21	rules 13:25	subject 22:8	8:2,4 17:25 25:9
24:14 25:5,11	ruling 23:25	submit 22:11	three 15:15 20:13
recorded 6:2	ruminating 21:6	subscribed 25:19	thursday 1:22
15:20 25:7		28:22	6:20 16:6 25:9
reflect 15:5	<u>S</u>	substances 10:2,7	time 13:5,9,22
refusal 24:2	s 3:1 4:1 5:1 7:25	substantive 18:4	14:25 15:14 23:10
refused 15:8 18:5	7:25,25 27:5 28:6	sucher 5:4 8:1	25:3,4,10 26:13
18:23	salah 1:15 5:3 8:1	sucher 5.4 8.1	times 20:13
refuses 18:8	salem 1:14 4:3	suing 9:10	
refusing 14:21	7:19	suite 5:5	tiscione 17:15
19:15,20 24:4	says 15:19		today 9:17 10:4
registered 2:9	see 20:17 23:7,13	suppose 21:4	11:18 13:15 19:12
26:3	send 25:1	sure 10:20 24:20	19:15 21:2,20
reiterating 18:19	sent 15:22 18:16	24:24	top 22:17
_	19:7	swear 8:11	transcript 13:19
relative 26:16,19	set 26:14	sworn 8:15 25:19	15:5 19:19 26:11
repeated 10:19	shabasson 5:8	26:6 28:22	transit 9:6
reported 1:24	7:24,25	t	tried 19:10
reporter 2:8,10	sheet 28:1	t 5:4 8:14 26:1,1	true 26:10
7:3 8:11 16:18	signature 26:23	27:5	truth 26:7,7,8
24:17 26:3	simply 19:15,20	take 10:11,14	truthfully 9:22
represent 17:19	slt 1:2	15:19 16:9	10:4
represented 15:12	solutions 28:1	taken 6:3 8:22 9:3	try 23:10
request 10:15 11:4	song 5:22 8:6,6	25:8 26:11	trying 20:14
12:4	sort 20:8 21:6	talk 13:3	two 18:16 19:11
required 13:24	speak 12:19	talked 14:20 20:4	22:5,7 23:6
respond 24:13	specialist 6:24	20:12	u
response 11:10	specific 22:24	tell 10:12 12:24	underscores 14:13
16:11	specifically 18:13	14:20	14:17
ridge 4:15	standard 19:18,19	testifies 8:16	understand 9:16
right 14:11 18:25	start 16:12	testify 26:7	10:15,17 11:6,16
23:12,18	started 18:2	testifying 9:17	11:19,23,24
rneumann 3:17	state 7:6	testimony 12:12	understands 24:15
road 28:2	statement 9:13	14:12 25:7	understands 24.15 understood 10:23
rockaway 1:13	24:13	thank 23:16	unfortunate 24:10
6:11	states 1:1 6:14	think 11:1 19:11	unger 3:3 7:14
ronald 3:16 7:8	stenographic	19:12 20:3,8	united 1:1 6:14
8:20 17:2,8,17	15:21	22:24	urge 23:2
27:10,15	10.21	ا من من است	uige 23.2
	¥ ¥	al Solutions	7040000 114

## [veritext - zeklaw.com]

Page	6	

<b>V</b>	willing 13:20
veritext 28:1	14:18
versus 6:6 17:21	wish 18:1
video 6:2,24 13:1	wishes 16:19
18:22 19:21 20:2	withdrawn 13:13
20:4,18 21:2,3,13	witness 8:12 12:24
21:14,16,22 22:14	14:9 15:6 18:5
22:22 23:1 24:17	27:2
25:6	worldwide 7:1,5
videographer 6:1	X
8:10 13:5,9 14:25	<b>x</b> 1:3,9,18 27:1,5
18:21 25:4	<b>xi01165</b> 2:9
videotape 12:8,15	y
13:16,21 14:12,19	y 1:16 5:12
14:22 16:3 19:16	year 18:12
24:3,5	year 18:12 york 1:1,21,21 2:6
videotaped 1:19	2:6 3:5,5,14,14
2:3 11:19,21	4:6,16 5:6,15,15
13:13 14:2,10,15	6:16,20,20 7:2 9:6
15:10,21 16:9	
18:6,7,14,20 19:24	youtube 20:4
videotaping 15:8	Z
	zeichner 2:4 3:12
videotaping 15:8	
videotaping 15:8 22:9	<b>zeichner</b> 2:4 3:12
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18	<b>zeichner</b> 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4 w waiving 14:11	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4 w waiving 14:11 want 12:1 13:15	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4 w waiving 14:11 want 12:1 13:15 19:24 21:11,20	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4 w waiving 14:11 want 12:1 13:15 19:24 21:11,20 22:20 24:12	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4 w waiving 14:11 want 12:1 13:15 19:24 21:11,20 22:20 24:12 wanted 24:9	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4  w waiving 14:11 want 12:1 13:15 19:24 21:11,20 22:20 24:12 wanted 24:9 wanting 12:14	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4 w waiving 14:11 want 12:1 13:15 19:24 21:11,20 22:20 24:12 wanted 24:9 wanting 12:14 waste 23:9	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4  w waiving 14:11 want 12:1 13:15 19:24 21:11,20 22:20 24:12 wanted 24:9 wanting 12:14 waste 23:9 weeks 14:7 19:9	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17
videotaping 15:8 22:9 volakos 4:14,18 7:20,21,21 volakosesq 4:19 volakoslaw.com 4:19 vs 1:6,12 28:4  w waiving 14:11 want 12:1 13:15 19:24 21:11,20 22:20 24:12 wanted 24:9 wanting 12:14 waste 23:9 weeks 14:7 19:9	zeichner 2:4 3:12 6:18 7:9 17:18 zeklaw.com 3:17

# Federal Rules of Civil Procedure Rule 30

- (e) Review By the Witness; Changes.
- (1) Review; Statement of Changes. On request by the deponent or a party before the deposition is completed, the deponent must be allowed 30 days after being notified by the officer that the transcript or recording is available in which:
- (A) to review the transcript or recording; and
- (B) if there are changes in form or substance, to sign a statement listing the changes and the reasons for making them.
- (2) Changes Indicated in the Officer's Certificate. The officer must note in the certificate prescribed by Rule 30(f)(1) whether a review was requested and, if so, must attach any changes the deponent makes during the 30-day period.

DISCLAIMER: THE FOREGOING FEDERAL PROCEDURE RULES

ARE PROVIDED FOR INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES ONLY.

THE ABOVE RULES ARE CURRENT AS OF SEPTEMBER 1,

2016. PLEASE REFER TO THE APPLICABLE FEDERAL RULES

OF CIVIL PROCEDURE FOR UP-TO-DATE INFORMATION.

# VERITEXT LEGAL SOLUTIONS COMPANY CERTIFICATE AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Veritext Legal Solutions represents that the foregoing transcript is a true, correct and complete transcript of the colloquies, questions and answers as submitted by the court reporter. Veritext Legal Solutions further represents that the attached exhibits, if any, are true, correct and complete documents as submitted by the court reporter and/or attorneys in relation to this deposition and that the documents were processed in accordance with our litigation support and production standards.

Veritext Legal Solutions is committed to maintaining the confidentiality of client and witness information, in accordance with the regulations promulgated under the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA), as amended with respect to protected health information and the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act, as amended, with respect to Personally Identifiable Information (PII). Physical transcripts and exhibits are managed under strict facility and personnel access controls. Electronic files of documents are stored in encrypted form and are transmitted in an encrypted fashion to authenticated parties who are permitted to access the material. Our data is hosted in a Tier 4 SSAE 16 certified facility.

Veritext Legal Solutions complies with all federal and State regulations with respect to the provision of court reporting services, and maintains its neutrality and independence regardless of relationship or the financial outcome of any litigation. Veritext requires adherence to the foregoing professional and ethical standards from all of its subcontractors in their independent contractor agreements.

Inquiries about Veritext Legal Solutions' confidentiality and security policies and practices should be directed to Veritext's Client Services Associates indicated on the cover of this document or at www.veritext.com.